



Minutes for February 19, 2008 adopted Mar. 4

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

37 Washington Street
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
Telephone: 508.228.7231 Fax: 508.325.7572
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Dirk Roggeveen (Chair), Linda Williams (Secretary), John McLaughlin, Valerie Norton, Dawn Hill Holdgate
Associate Commissioners: Diane Coombs, John Wagley **Staff:** Mark Voigt, James Grieder, Terry Norton, Ann Medina

~~ MINUTES ~~
February 19, 2008 – NEW BUSINESS
Cyrus Pierce Middle School Cafeteria – 5:00 pm

Called to order at 5:00pm. Staff in attendance: M. Voigt, J. Grieder

I. CONSENT

1. Mittenthal, Herb	118 Main Street	Revisions: COA #50612	42.3.3-102	Newman, Robert
2. NCF (Cranberry Bog)	Polpis / Milestone Road	New shed	25-38	????
3. Gammons, Richard	11 Curlew Court	New shed	68-518	Structures Unltd.
4. Wilmot-Taylor	16 Mill Street	Color change: trim, sash	54.4.4-76	Permits Plus
5. Munk, Jeffrey	7 Poor Richards Way	Remove window, add door	21-127	Gillian Farrell
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Coombs, Wagley			
Alternates				
Representing				
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams)			
Vote	5-0			
			Certificate #	51779-51783

II. OLD BUSINESS

1. T.O.N.	2 Fairgrounds Road	Public safety complex	67-40	Boos Kaestle
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Coombs, Wagley			
Alternates				
Representing	Michael McKean, David Barham (public comment)			
Concerns	Materials are a concern; brick would be preferred; negative massing is an issue (NE elevation porch, etc.); the building seems excessively tall (FD bays are dictated by functionality), pitches are 7/12, scale and massing are appropriate for a public building – 30-foot limit applies mainly to private homes; the building should not be entirely in excess of that limit; could the building be moved back further on the lot; elements that “pop-out” are a concern; SW elevation windows are oddly drawn; cement clapboard, trim, etc. are inappropriate for Nantucket; would it be possible to break the building up into smaller buildings?; “window walls” on the SW elevation – what are they made of (metal and glass); civic buildings are massed differently than residential ones – they need to look like what they are; allowing otherwise banned elements – like large glass-and-metal doors – will not set a precedent for private homes as the standards are different; the width of the firehouse bays corresponds to the length of two fire trucks parked back-to-back; has every attempt been made to share resources and space – yes; the intent of the cupolas is to provide natural light to all of the offices; NW elevation bumpout not necessary; high-columned porches too modern; simplify the lines; meeting rails should line up in dormers; cupolas should be same style			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams)			
Vote	5-0			
			Certificate #	

III. NEW BUSINESS

1. O'Rourke, Marilyn	7 Old North Wharf	New addition	42.3.1-82	John Lampe
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Coombs, Wagley			
Alternates				
Representing	None.			
Concerns	HSAB comments read.			
Motion	Motion to View with additional historical documentation and photos. (Norton) – JAMES			
Vote	5-0			
			Certificate #	

Minutes for February 19, 2008 adopted Mar. 4

2.	Deheart, Michael	26 Pine Grove Lane	New shed	67-405	Self
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Michael Deheart				
Concerns					
Motion	Motion to Approve with 6-inch rakes. (Williams)				
Vote	5-0				
			Certificate #	51784	
3.	Georgantas, Peter	9 Howard Street	New roofwalk, window chngs	42.3.3	Chris Skehel
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Peter and Elizabeth Georgantas, Chris Skehel				
Concerns	HSAB comments read.				
Motion	Motion to View with properly highlighted plans. (Williams)				
Vote	5-0				
			Certificate #		
	Williams departs 6:10pm.				
4.	Matarese, Sheri	3 North Point Road	New spa	38-83	David Bartsch
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Gila Fakterman				
Concerns	Is the adjacent field public or private access? Private.				
Motion	Motion to Approve due to lack of visibility. (Norton)				
Vote	4-0				
			Certificate #	51785	
5.	Erichsen, Jennifer	34 Rhode Island Ave – MAB	Move off	60.3.1-146	Tom Erichsen
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Jennifer and Tom Erichsen				
Concerns	No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Norton)				
Vote	4-0				
			Certificate #	51786	
6.	Erichsen, Jennifer & Tom	28 Ticcoma Way	Move on	68-981	Tom Erichsen
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Jennifer and Tom Erichsen				
Concerns	No concerns. (The stove pipe is pre-existing.)				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Norton)				
Vote	4-0				
			Certificate #	51787	
7.	Miner, Michael	15 Amelia Drive	New addition, stairs	67-430	Rex Ingram
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	????				
Concerns	Need to bring stairs in tighter to the wall (West elevation) – doing so would interfere with the walkway; inset from the building to minimize the bumpout. Reason for stairs? Access for housing on second floor. Examples of other such alleged staircases in the area should be provided.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Norton)				
Vote	4-0				
			Certificate #		
8.	Moore, William	26 Broadway – SAB	Move/demo shed	73.1.3-90	Rowland Assoc.
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Mickey Rowland				
Concerns					
Motion	Motion to View. (Norton)				
Vote	4-0				
			Certificate #		

9.	Moore, William	26 Broadway – SAB	New garage/studio	73.1.3-90	Rowland Assoc.
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Mickey Rowland				
Concerns					
Motion	Motion to View. (Norton)				
Vote	4-0				
			Certificate #		
10.	Bell, Alan	5 Deer Run Road	Revisions: COA	57-17	Luke Thornewill
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Luke Thornewill				
Concerns	No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Norton)				
Vote	4-0				
			Certificate #	51788	
11.	Gallagher, Corina	31 Pilgrim Road	Revisions to existing dwelling	41-97	Luke Thornewill
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Luke Thornewill, Corina Gallagher				
Concerns	Changes fit the style of the house.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Norton)				
Vote	4-0				
			Certificate #	51789	
12.	Lynch, Jeff	79 N. Liberty Street	New addition	41-148	Val Oliver
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Val Oliver				
Concerns	HSAB comments read. Chimney need to be inside the mass of the building; South elevation – addition should be set back, leaving trim in place on main mass, East – “Juliet balcony” is too wide				
Motion	Hold for Revisions per comments. (Norton)				
Vote	4-0				
			Certificate #		
13.	Zimmerman, Janet	10 Towaddy Lane	New dormers/fill-in porch	49.3.2-15.4	Val Oliver
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Val Oliver				
Concerns	No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve.				
Vote	4-0				
			Certificate #	51790	
14.	Raith, Elizabeth	5 Kite Hill Lane	AS-BUILT shed	42.4.4-65	John Raith
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	John Raith				
Concerns	No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve.				
Vote	4-0				
			Certificate #	51791	
15.	Crane, James	6 Saltmarsh Road	Move off	55-296	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Lisa Botticelli				
Concerns	No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve.				
Vote	4-0				
			Certificate #	51792	

16. Crane, James	6 Saltmarsh Road	Move on/addition	55-296	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Coombs, Wagley			
Alternates				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli			
Concerns	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve.			
Vote	4-0	Certificate #	51793	
17. Crane, James	6 Saltmarsh Road	AS-BUILT storage bin	55-296	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Coombs, Wagley			
Alternates				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli			
Concerns	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve.			
Vote	4-0	Certificate #	51794	
18. Goodnow, Theodore	35 Mass. Avenue – MAB	Demo house	60.3.1-6	Permits Plus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Coombs, Wagley			
Alternates				
Representing	Mark Poor			
Concerns	MAB comments read. The building is too tall per the Madaket Area Plan approved by the NP&EDC. Why is a new building being built on an eroding lot? No certainty that the erosion will continue in the same manner. The demo seems unnecessary. Smith's Point was developed in the 1950's and all of the house on the harbor are from that period.			
Motion	Motion to View. (Norton)			
Vote	4-0	Certificate #		
19. Goodnow, Theodore	35 Mass. Avenue – MAB	Demo garage	60.3.1-6	Permits Plus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Coombs, Wagley			
Alternates				
Representing	Mark Poor			
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to View. (Norton)			
Vote	4-0	Certificate #		
20. Goodnow, Theodore	35 Mass. Avenue – MAB	New dwelling	60.3.1-6	Permits Plus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Coombs, Wagley			
Alternates				
Representing	Mark Poor			
Concerns	MAB comments read.			
Motion	Motion to View. (Norton)			
Vote	4-0	Certificate #		
21. Bousa, Edward	102 Cliff Road	New solar panels	41-13	Permits Plus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Coombs, Wagley			
Alternates				
Representing	Mark Poor			
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to View with color photographs.			
Vote		Certificate #		
22. Bousa, Edward	102 Cliff Road	New hardscaping	41-13	Julie Jordin
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Coombs, Wagley			
Alternates				
Representing	Julie Jordin			
Concerns	The gate should be Craftsman style or simpler.			
Motion	Motion to Approve everything but the gate. (Norton)			
Vote	4-0	Certificate #	51795	
Roggeveen leaves briefly for health reasons. (7:06pm)				

23.	Harleman, Robert	96 Polpis Road	New dormers, window rev.	44-3.4	Permits Plus
Sitting	Norton, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Mark Poor				
Concerns	The casement windows would be changed to 6-over-1; they are preferable, but 6-over-6 would be better; dormers appear to be flush				
Motion	Motion to Approve due to lack of visibility. (Coombs)				
Vote	3-0				
			Certificate #	51796	
24.	Irwin, Richard	115 Cliff Road	Relocate/remodel dwelling	41-07	Permits Plus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Mark Poor, and Mr. Hay				
Concerns	HSAB comments read. What is the age of the building? 1930s. Is it only the façade that will be preserved, or the whole house? The whole house, minus side structure. Not opposed to moving structure on the lot; opposed to changing the entrance to the building – it should be maintained. The garage shed bump-out needs to moved over/back into the building. Thermal-pane windows should de swapped for TDL single-pane glass.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Norton)				
Vote	4-0				
			Certificate #		
25.	Irwin, Richard	115 Cliff Road	New dwelling	41-07	Permits Plus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Mark Poor and ???				
Concerns	Public visibility for the site is low. Needs a different front door; looks under-fenestrated. Balcony on NW elevation needs to be reduced.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Norton)				
Vote	4-0				
			Certificate #		
Recess from 7:15pm-7:35pm -- Williams returns at 7:35pm					
26.	Levenson, Norman	50 Nonantum Avenue	Revisions	87-38.1	BPC
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Mark Cutone				
Concerns	No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams)				
Vote	5-0				
			Certificate #	51797	
27.	Great Point Properties	1 N. Beach Street	Roofwalk, porch, fenestration	42.4.1-89	BPC
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Mark Cutone				
Concerns	HSAB comments read. In-fill of corner is unusual, and carved out would be preferred on porch. Roofwalk is inappropriate and incorrectly drawn (looks skirted)				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams)				
Vote	5-0				
			Certificate #		
28.	Maury, Lawrence	33 Main Street	Dormer revision	42.3.1-211	Emeritus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Matt McEachern				
Concerns	Appreciate the changes.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams)				
Vote	5-0				
			Certificate #	51798	

Minutes for February 19, 2008 adopted Mar. 4

29.	Lhota, Joseph	6 S. Miacomet Avenue	Revisions	82-356	BPC
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Mark Cutone				
Concerns	Appreciate the changes.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams)				
Vote	5-0				
			Certificate #	51799	
30.	Hinckley Lane LLC	24/28 Hinckley Lane	Retaining wall, hardscaping	30-21, 101/2	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Lisa Botticelli				
Concerns					
Motion	Motion to View. (Williams)				
Vote	5-0				
			Certificate #		
31.	Savel Nominee Trust	47 Pocomo Road	New dwelling	15-19	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Lisa Botticelli				
Concerns					
Motion	Motion to View. (Williams)				
Vote	5-0				
			Certificate #		
32.	Savel Nominee Trust	47 Pocomo Road	New garage	15-19	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Lisa Botticelli				
Concerns					
Motion	Motion to View. (Williams)				
Vote	5-0				
			Certificate #		
33.	Savel Nominee Trust	47 Pocomo Road	New pool	15-19	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Lisa Botticelli				
Concerns					
Motion	Motion to View. (Williams)				
Vote	5-0				
			Certificate #		
34.	Savel Nominee Trust	47 Pocomo Road	New cabana	15-19	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Lisa Botticelli				
Concerns					
Motion	Motion to View. (Williams)				
Vote	5-0				
			Certificate #		
35.	Anderson NT (Westender)	324/326 Madaket Rd – MAB	Demo garage	60.2.4-82	Cottage & Castle
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Jamie Feeley				
Concerns	Age of structure needs to be documented.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for main building. (Williams)				
Vote	5-0				
			Certificate #		

Minutes for February 19, 2008 adopted Mar. 4

36.	Anderson NT (Westender)	324/326 Madaket Rd – MAB	Move on-site/addition	60.2.4-82	Cottage & Castle
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Jamie Feeley / Ken Giles, Pamela Nicholls, Tom Erichsen, Shane Nicholls - Residential neighborhood does not warrant a larger commercial building (Erichsen); additional commercial development goes against the Madaket Area Plan (Giles)				
Concerns	Concerns with the massing; the original building's architecture is bad, and this expands on it				
Motion	Motion to View with properly clouded drawings and letters from the public. (Williams)				
Vote	5-0 Certificate #				
37.	Tedeschi, Luke	35 Fairgrounds Road	Revisions	67-685	Self
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Luke Tedeschi				
Concerns	Site plan is in error (basement access).				
Motion	Motion to Approve with corrected site plan. (Williams)				
Vote	5-0 Certificate # 51800				
38.	Dey, Andrew	7 Eagle Lane	Door, window revisions	55.4.1-160	Self
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Andrew Dey, David Barham - replacement door should be exact replacement of original (Barham)				
Concerns	HSAB comments read. The window changes are fine (they are essentially amending drawing errors), but the proposed front door is problematic; the "key-block/shalom" should be replaced, replacement door should be similar to the original; mudroom door needs appropriate hardware (strap or pintel hinge) – exterior hinge at a minimum				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with block detail, door surround and door as like-kind replacements, grade change, change to basement windows, softening of parge line where brick ends on foundation, moving of window on South elevation. (Williams)				
Vote	5-0 Certificate # 51801				
39.	Dey, Andrew	7 Eagle Lane	New retaining wall, fence	55.4.1-160	Self
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Andrew Dey				
Concerns	HSAB comments read. Is the previously eliminated retaining wall reappearing here? No, it is perpendicular. 7 and 9 Eagle are too close together for a fence of this height.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff as-built retaining wall with 5-and-1 fence (consult with staff as to detail), natural to weather, with an option of a Type-2 picket in the front. (Williams)				
Vote	5-0 Certificate # 51802				
40.	Pizzo, Cheryl	7 Williams Street	Move on (Pine Cottage)	55-434	Self
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Paul and Cheryl Pizzo				
Concerns	HSAB comments read. Cottages should not have been moved at all.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with move-off application resolved.				
Vote	5-0 Certificate # 51803				

III.HDC BUSINESS	
Review Minutes -	February 12 th , 2008
Approve Minutes -	February 5 th , 2008 (adopted by unanimous consent)
60 Day Denials -	
Other Business -	23 West York metal chimney stack (vent) – applicant needs to apply.
Commission Comments	

Adjourned 8:46pm

Shaded – Historic Core SOHD – ‘Sconset Old Historic District. MAB – Madaket Advisory